

---

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION REVIEW BOARD  
STAFF REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION**

---

Property Address:	<b>1321 Naylor Court, NW</b>	Agenda
Landmark/District:	<b>Shaw and Blagden Alley</b>	<b>X</b> Consent Calendar
		Concept Review
Meeting Date:	<b>September 22, 2011</b>	<b>X</b> Alteration
H.P.A. Number:	<b>11-466</b>	New Construction
Staff Reviewer:	<b>Steve Callcott</b>	Demolition
		Subdivision

---

KB Developers LLC seeks conceptual design review for construction of a three-unit, three-story residential building and a two-story garage building in Naylor Court.

**Property Description and Project Background**

The property is currently occupied by a modest one-story brick garage constructed in the first decades of the 20<sup>th</sup> century. Like most of the small-scale buildings along Blagden Alley and Naylor Court, it is not singularly distinguished but contributes to the network of alley structures that supported the surrounding residential and commercial neighborhood.

In 2005, the HPRB approved a conceptual plan to add two additional floors to the existing garage. The second floor was to have been set flush with the existing outside walls and expressed as a two-story carriage house; the partial third floor was to have been set back from the perimeter of the second floor. Since approval of that concept, the property has sold several times and the roof and a portion of the rear wall collapsed during a snowstorm in 2010.

**Proposal**

Due to the deterioration of the existing garage, the project calls for demolishing the building and constructing a new building that is closely based on the 2005 conceptual design. The new structure would appear as a traditional two-story carriage house, with garage/carriage house doors oriented to Naylor Court and six-over-one windows above. The side elevation would have smaller windows on the first floor, which, while evocative of horse stall windows are designed to provide privacy to the residential units. The third floor would be recessed from the alley-facing elevations to reduce its visibility. The building would house three side-by-side two-story townhouse units but would appear as a single carriage house on the exterior. A two-story garage would be constructed at the rear of the lot, with frontage on the side alley.

**Evaluation**

While retention and incorporation of the existing structure into the project was a nice conceptual idea, even in the best of condition, the feasibility of retaining it while incorporating it into a larger project was questionable. Constructed as a relatively temporary, one-story garage, the building has no foundation and would have required extensive structural enhancement, alterations, and underpinning to support additional floors. However, the subsequent collapse of the roof and portions of the exterior walls would require reconstruction to such an extent that the building would have to be essentially dismantled. At that point – where a building needs to be dismantled to be retained – it is reasonable to determine that it no longer contributes to the historic district due to a loss of structural integrity.

The replacement structure has been designed to have many of the same characteristics as the existing building and to relate to similar characteristics on surrounding alley structures. Like those buildings, it would have simple massing, unadorned brick walls, flat and segmental arched window openings, and a variety of vehicular and pedestrian-oriented openings. While detailing of the brick work, corbelled cornice, window openings and decorative elements remain to be developed, conceptually the project is compatible with the character of its context.

**Recommendation**

The HPO recommends that the Review Board approve demolition of the existing one-story garage building at 1321 Naylor Court as no longer contributing to the character of the historic district due to a loss of structural integrity, and approve the conceptual design as compatible with the character of the Blagden Alley/Naylor Court Historic District, with final construction approval delegated to the HPO. The applicant should continue to work with the HPO as the project is refined.